Resolution on Outdoor Dining in San Diego County

Submitted to the Board of Supervisors by Restaurants, Bars, Cafes and Retailers in San Diego.

December 11, 2020

The following resolution has been initiated by the restaurants in Little Italy and endorsed by them. We ask that you circulate this resolution on the 11th and 12th and submit to the Little Italy office so we can gather them and deliver the petitions to all of the Supervisors' offices on Monday the 14th. We also acknowledge that the virus is real and is spreading rapidly in the County and all protocols for wearing masks, social distancing and minimizing gatherings are critical to arrest the spread of the virus.

WHEREAS a Superior Court Judge in Los Angeles has just ruled the "The Restaurant Closure order is an abuse of the Department's (LA Health Dept) emergency powers, is not grounded in science, evidence or logic and should be adjudicated to be unenforceable as a matter of law." And further that COVID cases traced back to bars and restaurants accounted for just 3.1% of the non-residential outbreak locations "the vast majority of which were chain/fast food type restaurants and almost exclusively involved employees rather than customers"; and

WHEREAS on December 9th, the San Diego Union Tribune stated that 20% of the intensive care beds remained unoccupied across San Diego County, and the state requires a shutdown of outdoor dining once it has hit the threshold of 15% as being unoccupied. Furthermore, the article states "That's not to say that action cannot be taken to spread out the load. Hospitals could intensify the current trend of delaying non-emergency surgeries and other procedures, or they could, with the cooperation with the state health department, consider using field hospital beds already set up and waiting at Palomar Medical Center Escondido." and;

WHEREAS San Diego County has been placed in a mega-region under the Governor's Emergency Health order which includes counties from San Luis Obispo on the coast to the border, (Santa Barbara, Ventura, LA, Orange, San Diego) and Imperial and Yolo Counties – representing over 20 million Californians with varying rates of COVID cases; and

WHEREAS the Center for Disease control has stated that it is very difficult for the COVID 19 virus to spread in an outdoor environment and the "Purple Zone" of the state restrictions allowed for full outdoor restaurant, bar and retail activities in that phase; and

WHEREAS our political representatives must use a balanced approached in protecting first line professionals and workers in the health care industry against infection and overwork, but simultaneously must acknowledge that issues like steady income, paying rent and providing for one's family is also "essential" and should not be disregarded.

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED THAT:

The following restaurants, retailers and bars strongly urge the County Board of Supervisors act upon the following recommendations during the week of December 14th.

- 1. Vote as other Board of Supervisors have done to insist that the Governor eliminate his mega-region approach to monitoring ICU bed thresholds and allow County Health administrators base any decision of eliminating outdoor dining and retail sales on specific County conditions and accommodation of health care needs in that County.
- 2. That the County work with all regional hospitals to immediately increase the supply of available ICU beds by banning non-elective surgeries for now as well as using field hospital beds already set up at Palomar Medical Center Escondido.
- 3. That County Counsel review the California Restaurant Association case against the LA County Health Dept and report to the San Diego Board of Supervisors on the LA Superior Court judge's ruling on the legal implications of that case ruling in San Diego County.
- 4. That the County immediately set up a COVID Hospitality Advisory Board consisting up all 5 Supervisorial District and include reps from the restaurant, retail, hotel and visitor related industry to give input on future County directives impacting this industry.
- 5. That the County Board of Supervisors vote to reduce the 3-week period of shutting down outdoor dining and retail sales to allow Purple zone outdoor dining protocols to commence again at 12:01 a.m., Saturday December 19th, 2020 and apply such an order County wide.

We ask this on behalf for tens of thousands of restaurant, bar and retail small business owners and employees who see their work as "essential" and are all attempting to survive the crushing and indiscriminate policies that have been adopted by the Governor and County Board of Supervisors.

Supported by the undersigned organizations and business owners in San Diego County.

Organizations

Little Italy Association of San Diego Representing 800+ Businesses Ocean Beach Main Street Association Representing 520+ Businesses Gaslamp Quarter Association Representing 400+ Businesses La Jolla Village Merchants Association Representing 1,250+ Businesses Mission Hills Business Improvement District Representing 500+ Businesses San Diego Event Coalition

Representing 35+ Businesses

Businesses

4864 Newport Avenue, LLC AMN Real Estate Services, Inc. Andaz San Diego Annette Crutchfield Insurance Agency, Inc. ArtWalk San Diego Bar One Barbusa Barleymash Batten Accountancy, Inc. Bencotto **BK** Printing **Blarney Stone Pub** Bolt Brewerv Born & Raised Broken Yolk Café Broken Yolk Café (7 Locations) Broken Yolk Café (8 Locations)

Buon Appetito Café Gratitude Café Zucchero Caffe Italia California Wild Ales Chapter One Tattoo CheckerboardSTUDIOS Cheswicks Ciro's Civico 1845 Cloak & Petal Coleman Moving Systems, Inc. Convivio Craft & Commerce Davanti Enoteca Daybreak Island Grill Details SalonSpa, Inc. **Diane Sullivan Realty Dirty Birds OB** Dreamgirls **EcoLux Interiors** EdITS, LLC **Edward Jones Investments** El Camino **Extraordinary Desserts** Filippi's Pizza Grotto (14 Locations) Frost Me Café & Bakery **Fuse Events Gilmore Family Jewelers** Graze by Sam the Cooking Guy H.G. Fenton Co. Harbor Breakfast Hoppy Beer Gear Humble Heart Thrift Store and Boutique Hunter & Maddox Real Estate Intl. Huntress Iannitti Realty Group Ironside Fish & Oyster Isola Pizza Bar James A. Shaw & Company Juniper & Ivy Kaiserhof Karen's Consignment Gallery Kettner Exchange La Puerta

Landini's Pizzeria Le Parfait Paris Little Italy Food Hall Lumi M Winehouse Marriott San Diego Gaslamp Matt Kalla Insurance Agency, Inc. Mavericks Beach Club Meyer Fine Art, Inc. Mikes Taco Club Mimmo's Mona Lisa Italian Foods Monello **MVP Media Network** MVP Real Estate, LLC Nolita Hall Nonna **OB** Sands Property Management, Inc. **OB** Theatre Company **OB** Waves Salon Ocean Villa Inn Pappalecco Parakeet Café Peak Performance Holistic Therapies Petrini's Point Loma/Ocean Beach Landscape Princess Pub & Grille Pruett Realty, Inc. Puerto La Boca Argentinian Restaurant Queenstown Public House Rabbit Hole Raglan Public House Rest & Relax Real Estate **Retired Councilmember** Roma Mia Rooftop by STK **RoVino Rotisserie & Wine** Royal India (5 Locations) Rustic Root Sandbar Sports Grill Sandbox Pizza Seaport Realtors Service Kings Shino Sushi & Kappo Shore Thing Pet Supply

Side Bar Sign Diego Social Syndicate Sogno Di Vino Solunto Sorrento South Beach Bar & Grille Stride Stroll Sunnies Ocean Beach Sunset Cliffs Pilates Tacos El Cabron TapShack Tavern at the Beach Tazza D'Oro TD Himalaya The Black Stores, Inc. The Crack Shack The Double Deuce

The Field Irish Pub & Restaurant The Foodery by RoVino The Market by Buon Appetito The Smoking Gun The Stronghold The Tipsey Crow Tockin' Baja Lobster Restaurants TORO **Tranguil Home** True North Tavern Underbelly Urban Strategies Group Volcano Rabbit Voltaire Beach House Waterfront Bar & Grill Whiskey Girl Wolfie's Carousel Zinque

CC: Supervisor Greg Cox Supervisor Diane Jacobs Supervisor Gaspar Supervisor Jim Desmond Supervisor-Elect Nora Vargas Supervisor-Elect Joel Anderson Supervisor-Elect Terra Lawson-Remer Mayor Todd Gloria Councilmember Jo LaCava Councilmember Jennifer Campbell Councilmember Stephen Whitburn Ocean Beach Main Street Association Gaslamp Quarter Association La Jolla Village Merchants Association Mission Hills Business Improvement District

POLITICO



POLITICOCALIFORNIA



In this Tuesday, Dec. 1, 2020, file photo, general manager Damien Williams prepares outdoor seating at Settebello Pizzeria Napoletana in Pasadena, Calif. | Marcio Jose Sanchez, File/AP

California judge calls L.A. outdoor dining ban 'abuse' of powers

By KATY MURPHY and VICTORIA COLLIVER | 12/08/2020 08:00 PM EST

SACRAMENTO — A judge on Tuesday issued a blistering rebuke to Los Angeles County public health officials racing to control Covid-19's spread, saying an indefinite ban on

Q

outdoor dining announced late last month was "unsupported by any findings" and an abuse of emergency powers.

"The Restaurant Closure Order is an abuse of the Department's emergency powers, is not grounded in science, evidence, or logic, and should be adjudicated to be unenforceable as a matter of law," wrote Los Angeles Superior Court Judge James C. Chalfant in a tentative ruling issued Tuesday to a legal challenge from the California Restaurant Association.

The tentative ruling to block the indefinite ban won't have immediate practical consequences for Los Angeles-area restaurants, as the county is now under a temporary stay-home order tied to the region's quickly diminishing ICU capacity. But it marks a symbolic and legal victory for those challenging the emergency powers flexed by state and local officials — and a rare setback for public health authorities facing a worsening crisis.

The judge's 73-page assessment found that the county failed to justify its decision to shutter outdoor dining or perform a required risk-benefit analysis about the restriction. Outbreak data provided to the court, Chalfant wrote, showed that cases traced back to bars and restaurants accounted for just 3.1 percent of the non-residential outbreak locations, "the vast majority of which were chain/fast food type restaurants" and almost exclusively involved employees rather than customers.

He also wrote that the county's logic behind the closure "ignores the outdoor nature of the activity, which the CDC says carries only a moderate risk."

L.A. County Public Health Director Barbara Ferrer, who was named in the lawsuit, declined to comment about the case when asked during a briefing Monday. A spokesperson for Los Angeles County said in a statement Tuesday that "Los Angeles County is committed to protecting the health and safety of its residents from a deadly virus that has claimed the lives of nearly 8,000 of our friends, family and neighbors and that has sickened more than 450,000 people just in L.A. County."

The nation's most populous county, with more than 10 million residents, reported 8,547 new cases on Tuesday alone. Its five-day average shot to nearly 9,000, almost double the five-day average for the day after Thanksgiving that triggered the local order. The county also for the first time reported a daily hospitalization tally exceeding 3,000.

California Health and Human Services Agency Secretary Mark Ghaly on Tuesday acknowledged the state's regional prohibition on outdoor dining has more to do with preventing gatherings and limiting movement than the activity itself. "The decision to include among other sectors outdoor dining and limiting that — turning to restaurants to deliver and provide takeout options instead — really has to do with the goal of trying to keep people at home, not a comment on the relative safety of outdoor dining," he said at a press briefing.

"We have worked hard with that industry to create safer ways for outdoor dining to happen - to keeping tables further apart, to ensuring masking happens as much as possible, to create opportunities for air circulation to continue - all of those factors make sectors like outdoor dining lower risk," he said.

But Ghaly said the current levels of transmission mean Californians should reduce their risks by leaving home as little as possible. The state on Tuesday reported 23,727 new cases Monday — an increase from about 11,000 just two weeks ago — and a seven-day positivity rate of 10.1 percent. Hospitalizations have jumped nearly 71 percent and intensive care unit admissions are up 68.7 percent in the two-week period.

The exploding case count prompted Gov. Gavin Newsom last week to issue a new stay-athome order that divides the state into five regions and imposes new restrictions, including the closure of outdoor dining, based on regional ICU admission rates. State health officials moved two of the regions — Southern California and the San Joaquin Valley — into the new lockdown on Sunday evening when their ICU capacities dropped below the 15 percent trigger.

Five Bay Area counties plus the city of Berkeley on Friday moved preemptively to abide by the order through Jan. 4, even though the region's capacity hovers at 24.5 percent. The regions required to adhere to the new order must do so for at least three weeks.

"Right now, we're seeing such high levels of transmission that almost every activity — I should say every activity — that can be done differently and keep us at our homes, not mixing with others, is safer," he said. "Those are going to be the tools that help us get this under control."

But Ghaly did not directly address a reporter's question about the Los Angeles judge's request for more specific data that shows that outdoor dining is riskier than other outdoor activities that are still permitted. Brett Giroir, assistant secretary for health at U.S. Health and Human Services, told Fox News Monday that he hasn't seen "any data that says you need to shut down outdoor dining or outdoor bars."

Ghaly noted that the order still allows restaurant pickup and delivery and reiterated that "now is not the time to spend additional time outside of your household, potentially mixing with others, transmitting the illness far and wide."

He said the hope is that if the restrictions continue for "a short period of time" that the spread will be reduced enough for outdoor dining to resume. He said "we look forward to moving beyond the surge, having that industry and many other sectors reopen for business and really to move beyond the period we are in now."

The California Restaurant Association tried to block the county order last month before it took effect. Chalfant denied that request but ultimately ordered the county to submit evidence to support its decision. The restaurant trade group argued that the rule was arbitrary and unfair to businesses that had invested in outdoor dining spaces to weather the pandemic.

"Countless times in recent weeks, we've heard public health experts say that the key sources of spread of coronavirus currently are holiday gatherings and other private, household events, which are unregulated," said the association's president, Jot Condie, in a statement Tuesday. "Without evidence, it is unconscionable that the county can close businesses entirely and put thousands of restaurant employees out of work during the holidays."

Assemblyman James Gallagher (R-Nicolaus) compared the Los Angeles court ruling to a lower-court decision in a lawsuit he and Kevin Kiley (R-Rocklin) filed to challenge Newsom's use of emergency powers to shape the November election, including the order that every voter be mailed a ballot. Sutter County Superior Court Judge Sarah Heckman agreed that Newsom had exceeded his powers. Newsom appealed, and the case is being argued in a California appeals court.

"There still has to be a nexus between what you are mandating and actually curbing the spread of the virus," Gallagher said. "It's a sign that the judicial branch is finally starting to check these emergency powers, and they need to do so. We all agree that this is a serious pandemic and emergency responses need to be taken but that doesn't mean we undermine the foundational principles of our democracy."

About Us

Advertising

ICU beds could be filled by next week

Expert warns county supervisors that bed unavailability also possible by Christmas



Sharp Memorial Hospital nurses care for a patient diagnosed with COVID-19 in a negative pressure room on Friday. (Nelvin C. Cepeda U-T) BY PAUL SISSON

The county announced a record 26 COVID-19-related deaths Tuesday amid dire warnings of dwindling hospital bed capacity.

Though the latest fatalities did not all occur on one day, they nonetheless represented the largest single-day addition to the region's COVID-19 total. They ranged in age from 56 to

98 and all had other underlying conditions present in addition to testing positive for coronavirus infection.

And, just 20 percent of available intensive care unit beds remained unoccupied across San Diego County, with 140 out of 684 still available for additional patients. Tuesday's new case total was 1,276.

Natasha Martin, a UC San Diego infectious disease modeler, told county supervisors during a biweekly COVID-19 update that at current admission rates, models predict that local intensive care units will reach full occupancy as soon as next week with hospital beds likely reaching a similar state by Christmas.

Because hospital and intensive care admissions tend to lag infection by two to three weeks, there is really not much anyone can do at the moment to dodge the hospitalization wave that is about to arrive, especially since new case totals have continued to run far over the 1,000 mark for more than a week.

That's not to say that actions cannot be taken to spread out the load. Hospitals could intensify the current trend of delaying non-emergency surgeries and other procedures, or they could, with the cooperation of the state health department, consider using field hospital beds already set up and waiting at Palomar Medical Center Escondido.

County officials did not respond Tuesday to requests for more information on how hospital capacity will be collectively managed through 2020.

Modeling, which has generally tracked with actual infection rates, does suggest that the situation can begin to reverse itself about two weeks after the community takes action to stop the spread of the coronavirus.

"If we see a substantial reduction in mobility and movement, combined with high adherence to masks, we could see a very strong impact," Martin said.

That message did not seem to have much traction with a very frustrated public. Many called in during Tuesday's meeting to express their displeasure at the effects of the shut down, which has brought to bear even-more-significant levels of emotional and financial pain for many whose jobs cannot be performed remotely and for those who find themselves disconnected from cherished relationships.

County Supervisor Dianne Jacob urged everyone in San Diego County to "look in the mirror" to find who's responsible. Too many, she said, have bought into a growing narrative that the disease is no big deal or a total fabrication.

"Just wear the damn mask; it's that simple," Jacob said.

Those words were punctuated later in the day by a jarring Amber Alert that blared out a COVID-19 transmission warning to every mobile phone in the region.

Not even kids dreaming of playgrounds could catch a break.